



National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council

MINUTES OF THE SIXTH MEETING OF NATIONAL AGRICULTURE EDUCATION ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

(29 September, 2011)

The sixth meeting of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was held on **September 29, 2011 at 10:30 A.M. in the Mural Hall of Higher Education Commission (HEC), H-9, Islamabad**. The meeting was chaired by Dr. M. E. Tusneem, Chairman-National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) and attended by 15 of the 22 Council Members representing agricultural universities, research institutes and R&D institutions in public and private sectors. There was one proxy and seven apologies/absentees. (Annex-I).

2. After recitation from the Holy Quran, the Chair welcomed the Council Members to the sixth meeting of the Council and acknowledged their contributions and guidance in the implementation of NAEAC's activities. The Chair also thanked Dr. Riaz Hussain Qureshi, Advisor, HRD, HEC, the Vice Chancellors, Deans, Head of Departments (HODs) and faculty of the agriculture education institutions concerned for their excellent cooperation and support in the implementation of accreditation activities of degree programs. The meeting was informed that NAEAC has been striving to improve the quality of agriculture education degree awarding programs based on HEC approved criteria. The key to successful accreditation process is the clarity of the standards and criteria for external evaluation and accreditation on the one hand; and quality of the evaluators on the other. After the opening remarks, the Chair gave a brief presentation highlighting the activities and achievements of the Council during FY 2010-11. He noted that accreditation of degree programs being the single most important activity of NAEAC was given top priority and the number of programs accredited during the year was doubled compared to the previous year. Over the last three years, more than 60 degree programs have been accredited and a target of about 100 has been set to be achieved by 2011-12. The first round of accreditation

of all degree programs (160) should be completed by 2012-13, if adequate funds are made available.

3. Quality Assurance and Accreditation Awareness Seminars were also organized to cover almost all agriculture education institutions. In addition, the Council has regularly convened Council meetings and published its annual reports, financial audit reports, as well as quarterly progress reports (QPRs) and circulated to all concerned. During 2010-11, the Council also prepared and implemented Communication Strategy, organized Evaluators Training Program, published Parents Alert, updated roster of experts/program evaluators and updated manuals /toolkits.

4. The Chair complemented the Universities for taking various initiatives for Quality Enhancement. He commended the Vice Chancellor and faculty of UAF concerned for introducing new degree programs, adjunct faculty appointments, and international students' internship program at the University of Agriculture, Faisalabad. The introduction of Campus Management System (CMS) by the PMAS AAU Rawalpindi has been valuable in the quality enhancement and merit is being observed through transparency in the admission process. Maintenance of course files, new degree programs and achieving ISO 9000 certificate award. Similarly, Sindh Agriculture University, Tandojam was complimented for implementing Institutional Performance Evaluation standards for Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) and introducing Self Assessment Practices by the HODs.

5. The Chairman also briefed the Council on the planned activities of NAEAC for the year 2011-12 (Annex-II). It included external evaluation and accreditation of more than 40 degree programs through on-site visit of Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs) at eight agriculture education institutions during 2011-12.

6. The Chairman observed that NAEAC maintains a website (www.naeac.org) which is continuously updated with latest information / data and reports of AICs. It however, needs improvement both in terms of format and content. The IT working Group of Accreditation Councils (ACs) constituted by the QAA lacks the requisite expertise. Dr. Riaz Hussain Qureshsi, Advisor (HRD), HEC noted that it is HEC-wide problem. The

website should be attractive to read yet comprehensive and informative for all the stakeholders including industry, students, teachers and parents. The QAA has also desired incorporation of certain quality parameters in the websites of all the Councils.

Dr. Riaz Hussain Qureshi, Advisor told the house that website is very effective tool of information sharing and dissemination. HEC website is a regular agenda item in every weekly meeting as it also needs up -gradation/ and considerable improvement. So far, it has not become user-friendly and is continuously in the process of improvement. Mr. Fida Hussain, Director General QAA informed that HEC has accomplished work on the website of Computing Council by borrowing the expert support from the Pakistan Computer Bureau. Very soon similar support shall also be arranged for other Councils including NAEAC. The Chair thanked the DG QAA for arranging such expertise.

7. Secretary, NAEAC presented the formal agenda to the Council. A summary of the decisions taken in the meeting is given below.

Item #1: Confirmation of the Minutes of the Fifth Meeting of NAEAC

8. The minutes of the Fifth meeting of NAEAC were presented for review and approval.

The Council approved the minutes of its fifth meeting held on January 31, 2011 at Mural Hall of HEC, Islamabad

Item# II: Consideration and Approval of the Reports of AICs for FY 2010-11

9. During 2010-11, the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) successfully organized on-site visits to seventeen disciplines of agriculture for the external evaluation of 33 degree programs. These include PMAS Arid Agriculture University, Rawalpindi (07); University of Agriculture, Faisalabad (12); and KPK Agricultural University, Peshawar (14). A summary of the one-site visits of the AICs at various Agriculture Institutions is given (Annex-III). Copies of the AIC reports are available. Excerpts of the AIC reports including SWOT Analysis, actionable recommendations and the final recommendation for rating the degree programs are presented in the annexure of the working paper from page 12-49 in chronological order for consideration and approval of the Council.

Decision: The Council reviewed and endorsed the accreditation recommendations of the AICs. The Council members pointed certain shortcomings and inconsistencies in the SWOT Analysis of degree programs and advised to rectify them. The Council noted that SWOT Analysis should be based on facts and empirical evidence. It should be not only participatory but consistent as well. SWOT may be self-explanatory, precise and duly verifiable from within the sources of the host-Institution. Orientation of Program Evaluators/Experts on SWOT Analysis was realized and recommended.

Item# III: Approval of Annual Work Plan for Financial Year 2011-12.

10. Annual Work Plan 2011-12 was presented to the Council members. It was reported that Council planned to undertake on-site accreditation visits for 40 degree programs covering 20 different disciplines in Agriculture Universities and Colleges; held 15 Awareness Seminars to create awareness among the stakeholders and sensitize them on the significance of accreditation process for quality assurance, learning innovations and capacity building. Three more awareness seminars are planned covering all the agriculture education institutions in Pakistan as well as update and maintain Program Evaluators roster.

Decision: The Council commended the efforts of the Secretariat and approved the work plan of the Council for FY 2011-12.

Item# IV: Approval of Annual Report for FY 2010-11.

11. The Council circulated the draft of its fourth annual report highlighting various activities and achievements of the Council during 2010-2011 and asked the meeting for its comments and endorsement.

Decision: The Council members were asked to give their valuable comments/suggestions within a period of two weeks up-to October 15, 2011 and to incorporate the same in the annual report.

Item# V: Approval of NAEAC Budget for 2011-12.

12. The budget proposed for the year 2011-12 was presented to the Council. The Council members were of the view that budgetary provisions for such an important and technical task are nominal, need to be increased substantially. The house was informed that

HEC has ensured the availability of the funds to carry-out the planned accreditation and other activities.

Decision: The budget for FY 2011-12 was approved by the Council. It also recommended that in future allocations and actual expenditure details for the preceding year may also be presented along-with the budgetary proposal of the current year to the Council for review and approval.

Item# VI: Renewal of Annual Service Contract Agreement of NAEAC Staff.

13. The case of renewal of annual service agreement of NAEAC staff was presented before the Council members for their information and concurrence.

Decision: The Council approved the contractual appointment of NAEAC Secretariat Staff from September 2011 to September 2012 as proposed. Dr. Riaz H. Qureshi, Advisor (HRD), HEC observed that Chairman- NAEAC is competent to make new appointments and/or renew the contract agreements of NAEAC staff. Hence, in future matter may be brought in the Council meeting for the information of the house only.

Item# VII: Permission for Institutional Membership of Asia Pacific Quality Network (APQN).

Decision: The Council members observed that membership of professional regional and International Quality Assurance Networks such as APQN and INQAAHE is always welcome. However, keeping in view sizeable registration and membership fee of US dollar \$700, there is a need to further study the potential benefits of such a membership. The case may be pursued subject to the availability of additional funds for the purpose.

Any other Item:

14. Having deliberated on the agenda of the meeting, the Chair invited the members to table any other item or issue to be presented and discussed in the house. Prof. Dr. Shahbaz Talib Sahi, on behalf of Dean Faculty of Agriculture, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad presented the case of F.Sc. Pre-Agriculture program being offered by UAF, to the Council Members. The main features of this program are that is need based, more relevant and

target oriented. Students are inducted with rural background having natural interest and instinct in agriculture.

While highlighting the significance of the program, he urged all the degree awarding agriculture institutions to accommodate F.Sc. Pre-Agriculture in the admission eligibility criteria of degree programs of B.Sc. (Hons.) Agriculture Sciences, B.Sc. Agri. Engineering, and D.V.M. etc., this program was unanimously appreciated by the house and approved for implementation on national basis.

The important decisions of the meeting of Inter-University Faculty Board of Agriculture (IUFBA), constituted by Governor of the Punjab, held on 17-9-2011 at UAF are as under:

- The scheme of studies followed at UAF will be communicated to all the members electronically for consideration and adoption at their end.
- National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC), Islamabad will initiate efforts to bring uniformity in the curricula at national level.
- The house unanimously decided that wherever, there is independent agriculture related degree programs, e.g. Food Technology, should be brought under the umbrella of agriculture as a major subject with nomenclature of B.Sc. (Hons.) Agri. Food Technology of Food Science.
- The first degree recipients from Institute of Agriculture Sciences (IAGS), Punjab University may be entertained for admission to Master program at UAF and other degree awarding agricultural institutions with deficiencies as identified by the respective Board of Studies.

The house endorsed the above recommendations for implementation in all agricultural universities and colleges throughout the country.

15. In his concluding remarks, Prof. Dr. Riaz Hussain Qureshi, Advisor (HRD) of HEC asserted that standards of degree programs vary across the Institutions. There is a need to maintain minimum standards. Hence, need for Quality Enhancement Cells (QECs) and ACs was realized by the HEC. It is generally perceived that Councils are performing well. More emphasis is given to the theory than practical's aspects. Curriculum should focus more on skill acquisition than theoretical lecturing. In this regard, the input of the Deans and Faculty is very critical. Lab space and equipment is becoming gradually grossly inadequate as compared to increasing number of students. He urged that a minimum set of skills is needed for the newly inducted teachers for teaching.

16. The Meeting adjourned with vote of thanks to the Chair and from the Chair to esteemed Council Members.

List of Participants of Sixth Council Meeting held on September 29, 2011

1. **Dr. M.E. Tusneem**, Chairman - NAEAC
2. **Prof. Dr. Shahana Urooj**, Pro-Vice chancellor, University of Karachi, Karachi.
3. **Prof. Dr. Riaz Hussain Qureshi**, Advisor (HRD), Higher Education Commission, Islamabad
4. **Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ashfaq**, Dean Faculty of Agriculture, University of Agri., Faisalabad.
5. **Prof. Dr. Muhammad Munir**, Dean Faculty of Food & Crop Sciences, PMAS AAU Rawalpindi.
6. **Prof. Dr. Muhammad Naeem**, Dean Faculty of Crop Production, KPK Agri. Uni., Peshawar.
7. **Dr. Muhammad Ibrahim Keerio**, Prof & Dean Faculty of Crop Production, SAU, Tandojam.
8. **Dr. Mahmood Khan**, Director General, Agriculture Research, Tarnab, KPK, Peshawar.
9. **Dr. Noor-ul-Islam**, Director General, Ayub Agriculture Research Institute, Faisalabad
10. **Dr. Shakeel Ahmed Khan**, Wheat Commissioner, M/o of Food, Agri. & livestock, Islamabad
11. **Dr. Tariq Bahshir**, Deputy Chief, Pakistan Council for Science & Technology, Islamabad.
12. **Mr. Gul Nawaz Khattak**, Principal, Agriculture Training Institute, Peshawar, KPK
13. **Mr. Rana Kahlid Naseer**, Additional Secretary (Development), Govt. of Balochistan, Quetta.
14. **Mr. Qazi Bashir Ahmed**, Principal, Balochistan Agriculture College, Quetta.
15. **Dr. Muhammad Bashir**, Director, Rawalpindi
(Rep. of Mrs. Sumaira Samad, Additional Secretary, Planning (Agriculture), Lahore)
16. **Mr. Fida Hussain**, Director General, Quality Assurance Agency, HEC, Islamabad.
(Representative of Quality Assurance Agency, HEC)
17. **Dr. Shahbaz Talib Sahi**, Professor of Plant Pathology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad (By invitation)

NAEAC Planned Activities for 2011-12

S#	Activities	Tentative Schedule
1.	<p>Accreditation Activities: (42 degree programs) It is planned to undertake on-site accreditation visits of 21 disciplines for 42 degree programs at eight different agri. education institutions.</p>	July 11- May 2012
2.	<p>Awareness Seminars (Quality Assurance and Accreditation) (3): Council has organized 15 Awareness Seminars at 15 different Agriculture education institutions in the country. Three more seminars are planned for 2011-12.</p>	Nov 11- March 2012
3.	<p>Upgrading of NAEAC Website: NAEAC website requires substantial improvement in line with the 16 parameters provided by Quality Assurance Agency. Since requisite expertise is lacking in the Accreditation Councils (ACs), the task has to be outsourced.</p>	Dec 2011 & Jan 2012
4.	<p>Training Workshops for Program Evaluators: (2) The Council shall organize training workshops on regional basis. Expertise of the Master Trainers shall be availed as the resource persons for the proposed workshops.</p>	Dec 11 & April 2012
5.	<p>Meetings of the Council: (2) As per decision of HEC, the Council has to convene two meetings in a year.</p>	Sept 11 & May 2012
6.	<p>Parents Alert: (1) Parents' Alert advertisement is intended for the information of prospective students and their parents.</p>	March, 2012
7.	<p>Updating of Roster of Program Evaluators: Maintenance of a roster of Experts/Program Evaluators is obligatory. The roster is revised and updated from time to time. A group of thirty program evaluators/experts have been trained in the accreditation process in June, 2011.</p>	On-going activity
8.	<p>NAEAC Institutional Membership of APQN</p>	Subject to additional budget allocation

Summary of On-site visits of AICs for Accreditation of Degree Programs

Sr. No	University/Department	Date of Inspection	Status of AIC Report	AIC Composition
University of Agriculture, Faisalabad				
1.	Department of Agricultural Economics	28-29 Dec, 2010	Received	Dr. Dilawar Ali Khan Ex Dean NUST Dr. Munir Khattak Dean KPK AUP
2.	Department of Plant Breeding and Genetics	28-29 Dec, 2010	Received	Dr. Muhammad Munir Dean F. Agriculture AAUR Dr.S.Dilnawaz Ahmed Gerdezi Dean F. Agriculture, Rawalakot
3.	Department of Forestry, Range Management and Wildlife	7-8 March, 2011	Received	Dr. Sarwat Naz Mirza Dean RMF, AAUR Dr. Muhammad Afzal Director Forest Res. Institute, FSD.
4.	National Institute of Food Science & Technology	7-8 March, 2011	Received	Dr. Alam Zeb Chairman Food Science, KPK AUP Dr. Sarwar Dogar Production Manager, Fauji Cereals
5.	Department of Plant Pathology	28-29March, 2011	Received	Dr. Muhammad Arif Chohan Chairman Pathology, KPK AUP Dr. Ghulam Mohyuddin Plant Pathologist, AARI, Faisalabad
6.	Department of Agricultural Education & Extension	28-29March, 2011	Received	Dr. Noshad Khan Director Extension, AIOU Prof. Fazal Karim (Retd)
PMAS Arid Agriculture University, Rawalpindi				
7.	Department of Forestry and Range Management	11-12 Nov, 2010	Received	Dr. Masood Ahmad Quraishi Ex-Chairman Forestry Dept. Dr. Ahmad Hussain Dy. Project Manager, MEAS
8.	Department of Food Science and Technology	25-26 Nov, 2010	Received	Dr. Alam Zeb Chairman Food Science, KPK AUP Dr. Sarwar Dogar Production Manager, Fauji Cereals

Summary of On-site visits of AICs for Accreditation of Degree Programs

Sr. No	University/Department	Date of Inspection	Status of AIC Report	AIC Composition
9.	Department of Wildlife Management	4-5 April, 2011	Received	Dr. Ejaz Ahmad Dy. Director General, WWF Dr. M. Ali Nawaz UV & AS, Lahore
10.	Department of Agricultural Economics	19-20 May, 2011	Received	Dr. Abdul Salam Federal Urdu University, Islamabad Dr. Muhammad Azeem Khan CSO, NARC, Islamabad.
Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Agricultural University, Peshawar				
11.	Department of Food Science and Technology	30-31 Dec, 2010	Received	Dr. Faqir Muhammad Anjum DG, NIFST, UAF Dr. Sarwar Dogar Production Manager, Fauji Cereals
12	Department of Plant Protection	11-12April, 2011	Received	Dr. Ghulam Jilani CSO (Retd), NARC, IDB Dr. Muhammad Naeem Chairman Entomology, AAUR
13.	Department of Weed Science	11-12April, 2011	Received	Dr. Zahid Atta Cheema Chairman Agronomy, UAF Dr. Rashid Ahmad Shad CSO (Retd), Weeds, Islamabad
14.	Institute of Biotechnology & Genetic Engineering	13-14 May, 2011	Received	Dr.S.Dilnawaz Ahmed Gerdezi Dean F. Agriculture, Rawalakot Dr. Shahid Masood Chief Scientific Officer, NARC
15.	Department of Agronomy	13-14 May, 2011	Received	Dr. Fayyazul Hassan Prof. Agronomy, AAUR Dr. Mushtaq Hussain Kazmi Chairman Agronomy, Rawalakot
16.	Department of Agricultural Chemistry	13-14 June, 2011	Received	Dr. Muhammad Kalim Tahir Prof. (Retd), AIOU, Islamabad Dr. Ihsanullah Dy. Chief Scientist, NIFA
17.	Department of Horticulture	13-14 June, 2011	Received	Mr. M. Hashim Laghari HORT Specialist, Planning Commission Dr. Khalid Mehmood Qureshi Associate Prof. HORT AAUR