

For Members Only



AGENDA & WORKING PAPER
FOR
7TH MEETING OF NAEAC

27 November - 2012

National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC)

Old Comsats Building, HEC, H-8/1, Islamabad, Pakistan

Ph:051-90802681, Fax: 051-90802682, Email: infonaeac@yahoo.com

www.naeac.org

Agenda for Seventh Meeting of NAEAC

- 1 Confirmation of the Minutes of the Sixth Meeting of the Council
- 2 Status of Progress of Accreditation Activities 2011-12
- 3 Consideration and Approval of the Recommendations of the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs) on Degree Programs.
- 4 Budget Allocation and Utilization for FY 2011-12 and Proposed Budget Estimates for FY 2012-13
- 5 Proposed Annual Work Plan of NAEAC for FY 2012-13
- 6 Right of Appeal on Accredited Programs.
- 7 Renewal of Annual Service Contract of NAEAC Staff.
- 8 Any other Item with the Permission of Chair.

Agenda Item No. 1

Confirmation of the Minutes of the Sixth meeting of the Council

The Sixth meeting of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was held on September 29, 2011 in the Mural Hall of Higher Education Commission (HEC), H-9, Islamabad. The draft minutes of the meeting were circulated to all honorable Council members for their valuable comments/views before finalization. In the absence of any, the same was finalized and are placed before the meeting for approval of the Council (Annex-I).

Agenda Item No. 2

Status of Progress of Accreditation Activities 2011-12

National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) is mandated to improve the standard and quality of education of the degree awarding agriculture programs based on established standards, policies, procedures and criteria.

Evaluation and accreditation of the degree programs is the primary and most important function of the Council. During 2011-12, the Council has successfully carried out the accreditation and rating of 46 degree programs. These included: (i) University of Agriculture, Faisalabad (2); (ii) University of the Punjab, Lahore (2); (iii) KPK Agricultural University, Peshawar (8); (iv) Faculty of Agriculture, Rawalakot (2); (v) Islamia University, Bahawalpur (2); (vi) University College of Agriculture, BZU, Multan (10); (vii) Sindh Agriculture University, Tandojam (8) and (viii) University College of Agriculture, Sargodha University, Sargodha (12). In 2012-13, the Council plans to undertake on-site accreditation visits of all the remaining **degree programs (more than 60) with the objective to complete the first round of accreditation by 30 June, 2013 in all the Seventeen Agriculture Education Institutions in Pakistan.** The Council ensures transparent, neutral and unbiased external evaluation and accreditation process by the concerned experts. Efforts are made to carry – out the accreditation process in a participatory mode and transparent manner to share the findings and recommendations of AICs by all the stakeholders.

Agenda Item No. 3

Consideration and Approval of the Recommendations of the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs) for FY 2011-12

During FY 2011-12, the NAEAC Secretariat organized on-site visits to eight agriculture education institutions for the external evaluation of 46 degree programs (BSc (Hons) and MSc (Hons)). A summary of the on-site visits of the AICs at various Agriculture Institutions is given below. The soft copies of the AIC reports are available with NAEAC Secretariat. A set of hard copies is provided in the meeting. AICs recommendations are presented in chronological order for consideration and approval of the Council members.

Program Rating (BSc & MSc) by the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs)

| S No. | University/Department | Period of Inspection | Recommended Degree Program Rating ¹ | AIC Composition |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| University of Agriculture Faisalabad | | | | |
| 1. | Department of Livestock Management AIC Report# 32 | July 26-27, 2011 | Middle band of X with 72% score | Prof. Dr. Abrar Hussain Gilani Ex Director Advance studies, UAF Dr Muhammad Abdullah Uni. of Veterinary and Animal Sciences Lahore |
| Institute of Plant Pathology, University of the Punjab, Lahore | | | | |
| 2. | Institute of Plant Pathology University of the Punjab, Lahore AIC Report# 33 | October 19-20, 2011 | Lower band of X with 66% score | Prof. Dr. Muhammad Arif Chohan KPK AU, Peshawar Dr. Muhammad Bashir CSO (Rtd), CDRP, NARC, Islamabad |

Contd...

* Mr. Naseer Alam Khan, Secretary NAEAC joined all AICs and provided technical support and facilitation.

¹ Each AIC Report covers two degree programs i.e. B.Sc (Hons) & M.Sc(Hons) in the same discipline

Program Rating (BSc & MSc) by the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs)

| S No. | University/Department | Period of Inspection | Recommended Degree Program Rating | AIC Composition |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| KPK Agricultural University, Peshawar | | | | |
| 3. | Department of Livestock Management AIC Report# 34 | November 3-4, 2011 | Lower band of X with 68% score | Dr. Muhammad Younas University of Agriculture, Faisalabad Dr. M. Ashraf Mirza CSO (Rtd), NARC, Islamabad |
| 4. | Department of Entomology AIC Report# 35 | November 3-4, 2011 | Middle band of X with 70% score | Dr. Ghulam Jilani CSO(Rtd), NARC, Islamabad Prof. Dr. Muhammad Naem PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi |
| 5. | Department of Agri. Extension AIC Report# 36 | December 1-2, 2011 | Middle band of X with 70% score | Prof. Dr. Noshad Khan Dean , Agri. Sciences, AIU, Islamabad Dr. Shafiullah Khan Ex Director General, Extension |
| 6. | Department of Agricultural Economics AIC Report# 37 | December 1-2, 2011 | Middle band of X with 73% score | Prof. Dr. Abdul Salam Federal Urdu University, Islamabad Prof. Dr. Sarfraz Mian PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi |
| Faculty of Agriculture, Rawalakot, AJK | | | | |
| 7. | Department of Entomology AIC Report# 38 | December 22-23, 2011 | Lower band of X with 68% score | Dr. Ghulam Jilani CSO (Rtd), NARC, Islamabad Prof. Dr. Farmanullah Director QEC, KPK AUP |
| University College of Agriculture & Environmental Sciences, Islamia University, Bahawalpur | | | | |
| 8. | Department of Soil Science AIC Report# 39 | January 5-6, 2012 | Lower band of X with 67% score | Prof. Dr. Safdar Ali, Chairman, PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi Prof. Dr. Muhammad Abid UCA, BZU, Multan |
| 9. | Department of Agronomy AIC Report# 40 | January 5-6, 2012 | Upper band of Y with 64% score | Dr. Rashid Ahmad Shad CSO(Rtd), NARC, Islamabad Prof. Dr. Muhammad Bismillah UCA, BZU, Multan |
| University College of Agriculture, B.Z.U, Multan | | | | |
| 10. | Department of Agronomy AIC Report# 41 | February 13-14, 2012 | Lower band of X with 69% score | Dr. Rashid Ahmad Shad CSO (Rtd), NARC, Islamabad Dr. Abdul Khaliq, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad |

Contd...

Program Rating (BSc & MSc) by the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs)

| S No. | University/Department | Period of Inspection | Recommended Degree Program Rating | AIC Composition |
|---------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| University College of Agriculture, B.Z.U, Multan | | | | |
| 11. | Department of Soil Science AIC Report# 42 | February 13-14, 2012 | Lower band of X with 68% score | Prof. Dr. Safdar Ali, PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi Prof. Dr. Moazzam Jamil Islamia University, Bahawalpur |
| 12. | Department of Entomology AIC Report# 43 | February 15-16, 2012 | Middle band of X with 70% score | Dr. Ghulam Jilani CSO (Rtd), Islamabad Prof. Dr. Muhammad Naeem PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi |
| 13. | Department of Horticulture AIC Report# 44 | February 15-16, 2012 | Middle band of X with 70% score | Prof. Dr. M. Jamil Ahmad Faculty of Agrculture, Rawalakot, Azad Jammu and Kashmir Dr. Ishfaq Ahmed Hafiz PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi |
| 14. | Department of PBG AIC Report# 45 | February 15-16, 2012 | Lower band of X with 69% score | Prof. Dr. Muhammad Munir, PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi Dr. Syed Dilnawaz Ahmed Gardezi, Faculty of Agri., Rawalakot, AJK |
| Sindh Agriculture University, Tandojam | | | | |
| S No. | University/Department | Period of Inspection | Recommended Degree Program Rating | AIC Composition |
| 15. | Institute of Food Science and Technology AIC Report# 46 | March 7-8, 2012 | | Prof. Dr. Shahana Urooj Pro-Vice chancellor, University of Karachi-Karachi Dr. Aabid Hassnain University of Karachi Dr. Saeed Akhter UCA, BZU Multan |
| 16. | Department of Entomology AIC Report# 47 | March 7-8, 2012 | Lower band of X with 69% score | Dr. Ghulam Jilani CSO (Rtd), Islamabad Prof. Dr. Muhammad Naeem PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi |
| 17. | Department of Agronomy AIC Report# 48 | March 5-6, 2012 | Middle band of X with 70% score | Prof. Dr. Muhammad Bismillah Principal, UCA, BZU, Multan Dr. Rashid Ahmad Shad CSO (Rtd), NARC, Islamabad |
| 18. | Department of Soil Science AIC Report# 49 | March 5-6, 2012 | Middle band of X with 71% score | Prof. Dr. Muhammad Abid UCA, BZU, Multan Dr. Moazzam Jamil Islamia University, Bahawalpur |

Contd...

Program Rating (BSc & MSc) by the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs)

| S No. | University/Department | Period of Inspection | Recommended Degree Program Rating | AIC Composition |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| University College of Agriculture, University of Sargodha, Sargodha | | | | |
| 19. | Department of Agri. Entomology AIC Report# 50 | May 7-8, 2012 | Lower band of X with 69% score | Prof. Dr. Ghulam Jillani CSO (Retd), NARC, Islamabad Prof. Dr. Muhammad Naem PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi |
| 20. | Department of Agronomy AIC Report# 51 | May 7-8, 2012 | Upper band of Y with 64% score | Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ashraf PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi Dr. Rashid Ahmad Shad CSO(Rtd), NARC, Islamabad |
| 21. | Department of Plant Pathology AIC Report# 52 | May 9-10, 2012 | Upper band of Y with 62% score | Prof. Dr. Muhammad Arif KPK AUP, Peshawar Dr. Muhammad Bashir CSO(Rtd), NARC, Islamabad |
| 22. | Department of Soil Science AIC Report# 53 | May 7-8, 2012 | Middle band of X with 72% score | Prof. Dr. Safdar Ali PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi Mr. Tahir Saleem Ex-PD, NFDC, Islamabad |
| 23. | Department of PBG AIC Report# 54 | May 9-10, 2012 | Upper band of Y With 60% score | Prof. Dr. S. Dilnawaz Ahmed Uni. Of Poonch, Rawalakot Dr. Shahid Masood CSO, NARC, Islamabad |
| 24. | Department of Horticulture AIC Report# 55 | May 9-10, 2012 | Upper band of Y with 60% score | Dr. Muhammad Jamil Ahmed University of Poonch, Rawalakot Dr. Ishfaq Ahmad Hafiz PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi |

Agenda Item No. 4

Budget Allocation and Utilization for FY 2011-12 and Proposed Budget Estimates for FY 2012-13

The National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) has received the following annual grants from Higher Education Commission (HEC) from FY 2007-08 to FY 2011-12:

| (Rupees in Million) | | |
|----------------------------|-----------------------|---------------------|
| Sr# | Financial Year | Annual Grant |
| 1. | 2007-2008 | 2.50 |
| 2. | 2008-2009 | 2.00 |
| 3. | 2009-2010 | 2.00 |
| 4. | 2010-2011 | 2.00 |
| 5. | 2011-2012 | 2.00 |
| | Total | <u>10.50</u> |

The NAEAC is generating revenue through Accreditation Fee which is very low because all the agriculture institutions are in public sector charging low tuition fee. ED, HEC desired to fast track accreditation activities and to complete the first cycle of accreditation activities within 4-5 years. Since annual grant of Rs.2.00million was grossly inadequate, therefore HEC has increased the annual grant of NAEAC from Rs.2.00million to Rs.4.00 million with effect from FY 2012-13.

Budget Allocation and Utilization for FY 2011-12 is reported below. The proposed budget estimates for FY 2012-13 are also given below.

***Budget Allocation and Utilization for FY 2011-12**

| Code | Object | *Budgeted | Actual Utilization |
|--------------|--------------------------------------------------|------------------|---------------------------|
| 71-1 | Establishment Costs | 1,689,036 | 1,548,283 |
| 71-20 | Other Benefits/Honorarium for Program Evaluators | 250,000 | 280,000 |
| 72-10 | TA/DA | 410,753 | 500,135 |
| 72-14 | **Transportation | 100,000 | 108,345 |
| 72-2 | Communication | 40,000 | 38,670 |
| 72-31 | Stationery & other supplies | 60,000 | 63,620 |
| 72-32 | Printing and Publications | 58,000 | 57,000 |
| 72-37 | ***Other Misc. Expenses (OE & RM) | 5,000 | 4,524 |
| 72-43 | Computer & Office equipment | 45,000 | 45,005 |
| 72-44 | Furniture & Fixture | 80,946 | 80,891 |
| 72-50 | Audit Expenses | 25,000 | 25,250 |
| 72-60 | Publicity & Advertisement | 80,000 | 80,783 |
| 72-63 | Meetings/Seminars | 9,000 | 9,100 |
| Total | | 2,852,735 | 2,841,606 |

***Budget Allocations detail**

| | |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------|
| i. Opening balance as on July 01, 2011 = Rs.527,574 - Rs.74,247 payables of FY2010-11= | Rs. 453,327 |
| ii. Grant received from HEC for FY 2011-12= | Rs. 2,000,000 |
| iii. Accreditation Fee received from Agriculture Institutions for FY 2011-12= | Rs. 375,000 |
| iv. Amount received against previous adjustments, etc = | Rs. 24,408 |
| Total | Rs. 2,852,735 |

** Transportation (includes Car Rental, local travel charges, movement of goods)

*** Other Miscellaneous Expenses (includes Operating Expenses & Repair and Maintenance)

Proposed Budget FY 2012-2013

(Rupees)

| Code | Object | Budget Estimates | HEC Budget Allocation as of 17-9-2012 | Expenditure as of 31-10-2012 |
|--------------|-----------------------------------------------------------|------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------------------|
| 71-1 | Establishment Costs | 1,914,245 | 927,000 | 670,676 |
| 71-20 | a. Honorarium for Program Evaluators b. Other Benefits | 930,000 | 465,000 | 330,000 |
| 72-10 | TA/DA (Accreditation visits & Council Meetings) | 600,000 | 300,000 | 105,000 |
| 72-14 | *Transportation | 120,000 | 42,000 | 27,830 |
| 72-2 | Communication | 70,000 | 28,000 | 6,020 |
| 72-31 | Stationery & other supplies | 90,000 | 35,000 | 9,405 |
| 72-32 | Printing and Publications | 150,000 | 70,000 | |
| 72-37 | **Other Misc. Expenses (OE & RM) | 50,000 | 15,000 | 5,150 |
| 72-43 | Computer & Office equipment | 100,000 | 20,000 | - |
| 72-44 | Furniture & Fixture | 200,000 | 30,000 | - |
| 72-50 | Audit Expenses | 60,000 | 30,000 | 25,450 |
| 72-60 | Publicity & Advertisement | 200,000 | 100,000 | 80,516 |
| 72-63 | Meetings/ Awareness Seminars | 50,000 | 20,000 | 1,765 |
| Total | | 4,534,245 | 2,082,000 | 1,261,812 |

| | |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------|
| Opening Balance as on July 01, 2012 | Rs. 30,684/- |
| Grant received from HEC | Rs. 2,082,000/- |
| Accreditation fee received | <u>Rs. 50,000/-</u> |
| Total | Rs. 2,162,684/- |

- * Transportation (includes Car Rental, local travel charges, movement of goods)
 ** Other Miscellaneous Expenses (includes Operating Expenses and Repair & Maintenance)

Agenda Item No. 5

Proposed Annual Work Plan of NAEAC for FY 2012-13

Evaluation and accreditation of the degree programs is the primary and most important function of the Council. During 2011-12, the Council has successfully carried out the accreditation and rating of 46 degree programs by June 30, 2012. During FY 2012-13, the Council plans to undertake on-site accreditation visits of all the remaining **degree programs with the objective to complete the first round of accreditation by 30 June, 2013.**

| S # | University /College | Degree Programs |
|----------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------|
| <u>Plan for FY 2012-13</u> | | |
| 1. | Faculty of Agriculture, University of Poonch , Rawalakot | 10 |
| 2. | PMAS Arid Agriculture University Rawalpindi | 2 |
| 3. | University of Agriculture, Faisalabad | 2 |
| 4. | Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU), Islamabad | 2 |
| 5. | University of Karachi, Karachi | 4 |
| 6. | University of Haripur, Haripur | 2 |
| 7. | University College of Agriculture (UCA), D.G.Khan | 8 |
| 8. | UCA & Environmental Sciences, Islamia University, BWPR | 3 |
| 9. | University College of Agriculture, BZU, Multan | 4 |
| 10. | Sindh Agriculture University (SAU), Tandojam | 8 |
| 11. | Faculty of Agriculture, Gomal University, D.I.Khan | 10 |
| 12. | University College of Agriculture, Uni. of Sargodha, Sargodha | <u>8</u> |
| Total | | 63 |

2. Quality Assurance and Accreditation Awareness Seminars

To create awareness among the stakeholders and sensitize them regarding the significance of accreditation process for quality assurance, learning innovations and capacity building. The Council has so far organized Seventeen Awareness Seminars at 17 Agriculture Education Institutions in the country. **Two awareness seminars are planned for 2012-13 at University of Agriculture, Water & Marine Sciences, Uthal, (Lasbella), Balochistan and Department of Agriculture Sciences at University of Karachi.**

3. Roster of Experts/Program Evaluators

Presently, more than 100 Program Evaluators/Experts of different disciplines of agriculture are on the roster of NAEAC. Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs) are constituted by the competent authority from the NAEAC roster of experts. Second training workshop for at-least thirty program evaluators/experts of different disciplines has been planned in December, 2012.

4. Meetings of the Council

The Council has decided to convene two meetings in a year in view of the financial constraints and inadequate working agenda. So far, six Council meetings have been convened wherein accreditation of 61 degree programs were approved and other important issues were deliberated and decided.

Seventh meeting of the Council was planned in May, 2012 but could not be convened due to non-availability of funds. The Council meeting is now planned in the last week of November, 2012.

5. Publicity & Advertisement

Media coverage both print and electronic coverage of Council activities is carried out on regular basis. The Council is sending news regarding its Meetings, On-site accreditation Visits to various agri. education institutions, awareness seminars, etc. to the local print media. Material for HEC

News /Views is being prepared and submitted to HEC regularly for publication. The Council plans to publish the 'Parents Alert' in the Newspapers for the awareness of all the stakeholders.

6. Preparation of Annual Report

Preparation of Annual Report is mandatory, so far four annual reports have been published and circulated to all the Council members as well as other stakeholders. The fifth annual report (2011-12) will be finalized in October, 2012 and published in November, 2012.

7. Updating of NAEAC Database

NAEAC institutional database was established in 2009 and is continuously being updated. The major sources are the registration forms, institutional forms and e-mail surveys. The second e-mail survey (2011-12) has been completed. The processed information has been reflected in the annual report, 2011-12 and shared with Agriculture Universities /Colleges.

Agenda Item No. 6

Right of Appeal on Accredited Programs

The Council as per its bye-laws of clause-10 sub-section-f provides the right for appeal against the decision of AIC and outcomes of accredited degree programs but so far no such appeal has been filed. As in the certain cases grievances of the host institution regarding the conduct, approach and accreditation outcomes of their degree programs may arise, provision for right of appeal has been made in NAEAC bye-laws. Detailed procedure for the same is proposed as under:

i. Appeal by the Institution and Duration of Appeal:

In case an institution wishes to appeal for a review of the action on accreditation taken by AIC & NAEAC, a written application along with the prescribed fee should be sent to the Secretariat within 30 days of the date of notification of the action/outcome.

ii. Scrutiny by the NAEAC Secretariat:

The Secretary – NAEAC, after initial scrutiny will refer the application/pro-forma and other relevant documents to the Appeals Committee for further processing; all the relevant documents must be provided by the host institution to the secretariat as and when required.

iii. Appellant Committee:

On receipt of such an application, and being satisfied about its prima facie case, the Chairman - NAEAC may appoint a special Committee or Executive Committee, consisting of a minimum of three members including Chairman and two subject specialists who were not initially involved in the visitation, to conduct the appeal review. A meeting of the Committee will be convened, wherein the aggrieved institution and the members of the AIC may be invited to present their viewpoints.

The Committee may also visit the institution, if necessary. The recommendations of this Committee will be considered by the Chairman–NAEAC before arriving at the final decision. The decision of the Appellant Committee will be final.

iv. Appeals Fee:

It is proposed to charge a non-refundable fee of Rs.30,000/- for the purpose of appeal at the time of application for appeal.

Agenda Item No. 7

Renewal of Annual Service Contract of NAEAC Staff

The core staff of National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council has been hired on yearly contract basis as per policy of HEC/NAEAC. As per clause-5 of the Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for Accreditation Councils of HEC, the Chairman – NAEAC is authorized to renew the contract on the basis of satisfactory performance of the incumbent. Hence, annual service contract of the NAEAC Staff was renewed in September, 2012 except IT, Coordinator whose performance remained unsatisfactory despite number of reprimands and warnings. This is for the information of the Council Members.

Agenda Item No. 8

Any other Item with the Permission of Chair