



National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council



MINUTES OF 14TH MEETING OF NATIONAL AGRICULTURE EDUCATION ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

30 SEPTEMBER 2019

The 14th Meeting of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was held on **September 30, 2019 at 10:00 A.M. in the New Data Center of Higher Education Commission (HEC), H-9, Islamabad.** Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq A. Rajwana, Chairperson, National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) Chaired the meeting attended by 19 members, including two via video link, one proxy. There were two apologies. (Annexure-I).

2. The meeting commenced with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chair in his opening remarks welcomed the Members to the 14th Meeting of the Council.

3. After the introductory remarks by the Chair; item-wise agenda of the meeting presented before Council Members for consideration and approval. A summary of the decisions taken in the meeting is given below:

Agenda Item# 1: Brief introduction of Council Members, Acknowledgment of Services rendered by Dr. M.E. Tusneem, Ex-Chairman, NAEAC and Commemoration of Late Mr. Naseer Alam Khan, Ex-Secretary, NAEAC.

4. The Chair warmly welcomed the senior and new Council Members and also complimented them for their support and commitment to meet the objectives of Council. Chair also appreciated and acknowledged valuable services rendered by Dr. M.E. Tusneem, Ex-Chairman, NAEAC and commemorate (Late) Mr. Naseer Alam Khan Ex-Secretary, NAEAC for their hard work and dedication to advance the Council where by it is recognized and valued in whole Pakistan. Honorable members also offered "Fateha" and prayed for the eternal peace of (Late) Mr. Naseer Alam Khan.

Agenda Item#2: Confirmation of the Minutes of the Thirteenth Meeting of NAEAC

5. Minutes of 13th meeting of the Council presented for confirmation of the Council members. In the absence of any comments and objection, *the minutes of thirteenth Meeting of the Council were approved as presented.*

Agenda Item#3: Overview of NAEAC's Operational Activities by Chairperson

6. The Chairperson highlighted major activities and achievements of the Council during 2018-19 including sixteen accreditation and evaluation visits by the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs), review meeting with the Head of agriculture education institution. Chairperson informed the house that due to the expiry of Chairperson's tenure and sad demise of Mr. Naseer Alam, planned activities of 2018-19 were not achieved. However, he ensured honorable members that with their help and guidance, council will get back to its traditional progress path. Chairperson also expressed his serious concerns over deteriorating quality of graduates being produced in HEI's primarily due to unprecedented increase in enrollment of students especially in new institutions which also lack adequate faculty and meager physical infrastructure. He emphasized the need to ensure adequate human and financial resources prior to initiate any new institutions to enable them to meet required educational standard and produce graduates who are competitive nationally and internationally.

Agenda Item#4: Approval of the Accreditation Ratings of Agriculture Degree Programs evaluated during 2018-19

Decision: *The Council members examined the evaluation ratings of 40-degree programs in 11 institutions reviewed by NAEAC during 2018-19 and approved the ratings as recommended.*

They however, expressed their concern regarding annual increase in student admissions without corresponding to increase in teaching-learning infrastructure and resources. It is considered as major factor for decline of quality in academia as expressed earlier by the Chairperson in opening remarks. The Council Members emphasized that Council must adhere to its objectives of quality enhancement in HEI's and stressed to verify prior to visit such institutions whether they fulfill the minimum criteria and having NOC from HEC.

Agenda Item#5: Review Meetings with Directors and HODs regarding Implementation Status of AIC Recommendations

7. The Chairperson, NAEAC briefed the Council on the purpose and objective of review meeting conducted during 2017-18. The recommendations of the review meeting were shared with the honorable members.

Decision: *Members acknowledged and cherished the review meeting process initiated by NAEAC since it involves concerned authorities of the host institutions and the Council to discuss the issues in detail that need improvement.*

Agenda Item#6: Proposed Annual Work Plan for FY 2019-20

8. Chairperson, NAEAC presented annual work plan for FY 2019-20 consisting of five major activities of accreditation process covering external evaluation and assessment of 83-degree programs comprising zero visits, on-site visits, follow-up visits and 2nd round visits. In addition, three review meetings, two awareness seminars, four training workshops and one Council meeting are also planned for FY 2019-2020 to undertake at least 31 visits of the concerned institutions across Pakistan.

Decision: *The Council members endorsed the work plan activities for FY 2019-20*

Agenda Item#7: Proposal Budget Allocations for FY 2019-20

9. The chair presented the estimated budget allocations for FY 2019-20. Based on the budget utilization of FY 2018-19 and as per operational plan of work, the estimated budget for FY 2019-20 is Rs.8.596 million, compared to budget utilization of 4.414 million during 2018-19. Honorable members understood the reason for under-utilization of budget due to sad demise of Secretary, NAEAC and term expiry of Ex-Chairman, NAEAC during 2018-19.

Decision: *After thorough deliberation and discussion honorable council members endorsed the proposed budget allocations for FY 2019-20.*

Agenda Item#8: Consideration and Approval for Registration of Agriculture Graduates

10. Chairperson, NAEAC briefed the Council Members about the detail and benefits of the registration of Agriculture Graduates, Professional Agriculture Graduates and Fellow Agriculturists. He also informed the house that number of meetings in this regard have been conducted by HEC authorities and the matter is approved in 34th HEC Commission meeting held on August 30-31, 2019. Registration of graduates will help the Council to make database based on details for each graduate received from each Higher Education Institutions having NAEAC related programs across Pakistan.

Decision: *The Council Members agreed on Registration of Agriculture Graduates as proposed based on majority voting and emphasized that the digitization process should be transparent and fool proof.*

Agenda Item No. 9: Consideration and Approval for Revision of the Accreditation Fee Structure

11. The chair briefed the Council members that the amount and structure of accreditation fee charged by NAEAC is being subsidized by HEC. He briefed the house about the variation in fee charged by five HEC established accreditation Councils (150,000/- to 250,000/- per degree program). Current accreditation fee structure of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was approved nearly two years ago. Recently, few private as well as private – public partnership institutions of higher learning have initiated a single degree program in agriculture. It is needed that the Council should revise its accreditation fee as per increased inflation and market trends to meet sustainable levels.

Existing Accreditation Fee Structure, 2018-19			Proposed Accreditation Fee Structure* 2019-20		
Public Institutions	Private Institutions	Public-Private Partnership Institutions	Public Institutions	Private Institutions	Public-Private Partnership Institutions
Rs. 120,000 up to three disciplines	At least Rs. 150,000 per discipline. (Based on full cost recovery)	At least Rs. 120,000 up-to three disciplines	Rs. 100,000/- per discipline	Rs. 250,000/- per discipline. (Based on full cost recovery)	Rs. 250,000/- per discipline

* Accreditation fee for zero visit, formal visit and follow-up visit etc.

Decision: *The house agreed with the necessity to increase fee structure based on actual costs incurred and inflation factors and approved the proposal with little modifications (Rs.80,000/- for Public Institutions, Rs.200,000/- for Public-Private Partnership Institutions and Rs.250,000/- for Private Institutions) per degree program and endorsed the same with effect from financial year 2019-20.*

Agenda Item No.10: Consideration and Approval to Charge Awareness Seminars Fee

The house was briefed that so far Council has delivered 48 Awareness seminars in 47 institutions free of charge across Pakistan. The importance of awareness seminars is beyond expectations for students, faculty and administration of HEI's. However under the prevailing financial circumstances it is proposed that an amount of Rs.50,000/- may be charged from the host institutions for arrangement and organization of awareness seminars.

Decision: *The Council Members agreed to charge Rs.50,000/- for accreditation awareness seminar to meet the relevant expenditures (Organizational cost, TA/DA, Honorarium etc) from the financial year 2019-20.*

Agenda Item No. 11: Five Years Comprehensive Work Plan of NAEAC

The Council has taken an initiative to prepare five years comprehensive Work Plan on the directions of HEC along with background including Mission, Mandate, Objectives as per ENQA guidelines and is given in **Annexure-IV**. Chair briefed the house that few variations may come across during practical execution of plan due to certain un-controllable circumstances.

Decision: *The Council Members appreciated and endorsed the same with permission to change the five years comprehensive work plan as and when required to meet the emerging needs.*

Agenda Item No. 12: Consideration and Approval to add Additional Emerging Disciplines Pertaining to Agriculture

NAEAC believe in dynamism and moving forward with the emerging Agricultural disciplines. Till date 16 disciplines of agriculture are approved under the scope of Council. However, there are some additional emerging disciplines which also fall under the scope of the Council as given below:

- i. Fisheries and Aqua Culture
- ii. Poultry Science
- iii. Climate Change/Climate Studies
- iv. Environmental Sciences
- v. Human Nutrition and Dietetics
- vi. Any other suggested by the Council Members

Decision: *The Council Members agreed and approved the emerging disciplines mentioned above and asked the Council to check the status of Climate Change and Studies and Water Management, Dairy Technology, Microbiology if it comes under the purview of NAEAC.*

Agenda Item No. 13: Regularization of Office Attendant/Despatch Rider (BPS-07)

The Chairperson, NAEAC briefed the Council that as per bye-laws of the NAEAC vide para 16 (b) "The Secretariat shall be supported by office manager and relevant supporting staff to be hired by the Higher Education Commission as per its terms and conditions. Such staff will be appointed on permanent ground for the proper continuation of the record".

Chairperson, NAEAC quoted the decision taken in minutes of 11th Council Meeting of NAEAC held on October 26, 2015 under agenda item 13 that is reproduced as “The Council approved the revision of pay packages for NAEAC Secretariat employees based on Govt. BPS (2015) as adopted by HEC officers and staff at corresponding levels of BPS-19, BPS-18, BPS-17 and BPS- 2 retroactively with effect from July 01, 2015 as one-time adjustment and follow thereafter the rules and regulations of HEC for staff salaries, allowances and other benefits”

Further it was informed by the Chair that two core employees of NAEAC i.e. Mr. Raja Mehtab Yasin, Dy. Director and Mr. Abdullah, IT Coordinator were already regularized in the month of August, 2017. Mr. M. Shafqat has served an application to the chairperson with the request to regularize his services in line with the regularization policy as adopted earlier. Hence, it is proposed that services of Mr. Muhammad Shafqat, Office Attendant/Despatch Rider (BPS-04) may be regularized.

Decision: *The Council Members agreed the proposal to regularize the services of Mr. Muhammad Shafqat, Office Attendant/Dispatch Rider (BPS-04) subject to the verification of eligibility criteria.*

Agenda Item No. 14: Request of Mr. Muhammad Shafqat, Office Attendant/Despatch Rider for Grant of Loan of Rs.200,000/ for the Construction of House

Mr. Muhammad Shafqat, Office Attendant/Despatch Rider has requested the Council to grant loan of Rs. 200,000/ to enable him to construct his house, he will pay back the loan amount in 25 monthly installments @Rs.8,000/ per month. The same is submitted for kind consideration and approval of the Council Members.

Decision: *The Council Members did not endorse the request as it is not in line with the financial rules and regulations. However the house showed sympathy with Mr. Shafqat and some of the members offered financial assistance from their own pocket.*

Agenda Item No. 15: Consideration and Approval for the Initiation of E-Newsletter by NAEAC

In order to live up with the emerging trends in social, broad cast, print and electronic media organizations like NAEAC have different challenges to reach their target audiences. This situation demands certain out of box actions to remain connected with all the stakeholders so that they can learn about the Council activities, progress and initiatives in a competitive manner. Keeping in view the current financial health of Council, it is proposed to initiate a tri-monthly e-newsletter which will cover all the activities performed by Council during that duration and will be distributed electronically to the stakeholders through social media, emails, WhatsApp, etc.

If agreed council may approve the initiation of e-newsletter and authorize the Chairperson for the establishment of editorial board for the said purpose.

Decision: *The Council Members appreciated and endorsed the initiative of e-newsletter.*

Agenda Item No. 16: Consideration and Approval for the Provision of Accreditation Certificate to the HEI

So far NAEAC has accredited 259 degree programs throughout Pakistan and the data is only available at NAEAC website or with the administrative offices of HEIs. It is proposed that Accreditation Certificate may be provided to Chairperson of the department mentioning details of institution, department, degree program accredited and obtained score with category duly signed by Chairperson and Secretary of the Council on a security paper having embossed seal.

If agreed the council may approve the provision of Accreditation Certificate to the HEIs as given above.

Decision: *The Council Members agreed to provide the Accreditation Certificates to HEIs as proposed.*

Agenda Item No. 17: Consideration and Approval to get Country Membership of Internationally Recognized Scientific Societies

Worldwide various scientific societies co-ordinate with other societies through membership linkages at country level in which one of the organizations representing the major chunk of that particular scientific community gets itself registered with international society and the benefit is harvested by whole scientific community of country as per agreement and policies. NAEAC being the major stakeholder and the only federal organization representing whole Pakistan in agricultural education and research feel the responsibility to lead the way by obtaining membership/registering Pakistan with five major international societies of the world in the field of agriculture. Detailed description will be provided during the meeting with facts and figures for further discussion and approval.

Decision: *The Council Members deferred the case with recommendation to do more working on it and may be submitted in the next meeting.*

Agenda Item No. 18: Consideration and approval for the initiation of Annual Evaluation (ACR) of NAEAC Employees

After the inception of NAEAC in 2007, the Council was largely comprised of contract employees. But later in the year 2017, the services of two employees of the Council namely Mr. Raja Mehtab Yasin (Deputy Director Admin & Finance) and Mr. Abdullah (IT coordinator) were regularized. The standard operating Procedure (SOP) of the public sector organizations is to evaluate the

performance of the employees (Contract/ Adhoc /Regular) annually in the form of Annual Confidential Report (ACR) which is maintained to promote, acknowledge or measure the overall suitability of employees for further promotion etc. Until now this SOP is not operational at NAEAC. Therefore it is suggested that in order to assess and appreciate the employees of the Council, annual confidential report (ACR) of all the employees of the Council (Contract/ Adhoc /Regular) should be maintained. To serve this purpose, the Council has developed comprehensive form which is given at **annexure-V**.

If agreed the two drafted ACR forms for the employee of the Council may be approved to be implemented from the current year (Jan 2019-Dec 2019) onwards.

Decision: *The Council Members appreciated the idea and recommended to constitute a committee from HEC to vet the forms. House also desired for preparation of Service rules of NAEAC in future as well.*

Agenda Item No. 19: Addition of new members in the approved panel of evaluators for Accreditation Inspection Committee (AIC)

The AIC (Accreditation Inspection Committee) constituted by NAEAC comprises of 1-2 subject specialists. With the addition of emerging disciplines under the purview of the Council, there is a need to train/add/select new members in the approved panel/list of program evaluators. It is noticed that sometimes even after confirmation program experts, are unable to join the AIC team due to some unforeseen/ personal reasons. It is suggested that in such situation, in order to carry out the planned visit and ensure the smooth flow of work plan, the Chairperson of the Council may be granted special powers to nominate the replacement of the absent member from the available scientific pool of a particular subject.

Decision: *The Council Members agreed and granted special powers to Chairperson, NAEAC to nominate the AIC member from the available pool of a particular subject.*

Agenda Item No. 20: Consideration and Approval for Enhancement of Program Evaluators Remuneration and personal car mileage expenditures for official assignments.

It has been observed that the remuneration for the program evaluators has not been enhanced for the last several years. Normally NAEAC has very senior members on the roster who spare their precious time on our request. It is proposed that evaluation fee may be increased from Rs 5000/ per day to Rs 7000/ per day. Moreover due to inflation and other overhead increase in cost using

personal vehicle for official assignment has become difficult to manage in the given mileage of Rs 10/km. Council appreciate and acknowledge the facilitation extended by any official to use personal vehicle for official matters on our request but at the same time would like to understand the ground realities in time and space. It is therefore proposed that mileage may be increased up to Rs 15/ km so that the original cost incurred during official travel may be recovered under rising fuel and overhead expenses.

Decision: *The Council Members agreed to enhance the program evaluators remuneration/honorarium from Rs.5,000/- to Rs.7,000/- per day. The Council Members did not agreed to enhance mileage rate for using personal vehicle for official matter and suggested for other options while adopting HEC/Government of Pakistan TA/DA rules.*

Current Work Agenda Item No.1: Request from Vice Chancellor, The University of Agriculture, D. I. Khan regarding Issues of the University

Prof. Dr. Ejaz Ahmad Khan Vice Chancellor, University of Agriculture D I Khan has requested Chairperson NAEAC through a letter (copy attached) raising some issues faced by university. It is mentioned that University of Agriculture, D. I. Khan has been established by gazette notification No PA/KP/Bills-173/2018/5037 KP universities bill 2018 passed on 26th February 2018 which was previously part of Gomal University, D. I. Khan as Faculty of Agriculture. A meeting was held under the Chairmanship of Executive Director, HEC on 23-08-2016 wherein it was committed by VC, Gomal University, D. I. Khan to hand over already announced land (1000 kanals) along with available infrastructure, labs, qualified faculty, etc. and likewise same commitments were made by VC, Gomal University, D.I. Khan in different meetings including Secretary for Higher Education Department, KP and Chairman, HEC, Islamabad, on 16-10-2016 and 13-10-2017 respectively with no positive results.

The Vice Chancellor, University of Agriculture, D. I. Khan has also requested the Council to facilitate for smooth transfer of committed land along with assets, teaching staff, etc. Gomal University DI Khan.

Agenda is placed for the discussion of honorable members.

Decision: *The Council advised to refer the case to Quality Assurance Agency, HEC Islamabad.*

Current Work Agenda Item No.2: Consideration and approval for participation of council members through video link from distant places

Managing quorum to organize fruitful council meeting is imperative. However, it has been observed that several members have shown their inability to participate in council meetings despite efforts due to official assignments in their parent departments. Organizing a successful council meeting takes lot of administrative, physical and financial toil. In order to avoid quorum issues and help the members to save travelling time, it is suggested that participation through video link/skype etc should be encouraged specially from distant places so that maximum participation may takes place. Further, to appreciate the intellectual input provided by the honorable member it is suggested that an amount of Rs 5,000/- may be sanctioned in favour of the member to be given through crossed cheque after the meeting.

Decision: The Council appreciated the participation of members belonging to distant places to participate on video link/skype. House also agreed to pay honorarium of Rs.5,000/- to each Council Members for their participation in Council Meeting via video link for their intellectual input.

List of Participants of 14th Council Meeting held on September 30, 2019

1. **Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq A. Rajwana**, Chairperson, NAEAC/Pro-VC, MNSUA, Multan
2. **Prof. Dr. Nadeem Akhtar Abbasi**, Vice Chairman, NAEAC/Pro-VC, PMAS AAU Rawalpindi
3. **Dr. Nadia Tahir**, Managing Director, Quality Assurance Agency, HEC, Islamabad
4. **Prof. Dr. Ghulam Jilani**, Pro-VC, Lasbela Uni. of Agriculture, Water & Marine Sciences, Uthal, Lasbela
5. **Prof. Dr. Qamaruddin Chachar**, Dean, Faculty of Crop Production, Sindh Agri. University, Tandojam
6. **Prof. Dr. Farman Ullah**, Dean, Faculty of Crop Protection, The University of Agriculture, Peshawar
8. **Prof. Dr. Fayyaz Ul Hassan Sahi**, Acting Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Sciences, PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi
9. **Prof. Dr. Shafqat Saeed**, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture & Environmental Sciences, MNSUA, Multan
10. **Dr. Abid Mahmood**, Director General (Research), AARI, Faisalabad
11. **Dr. Naveed Akhtar**, Director General (Research), Agriculture Research Institute, Peshawar
11. **Mr. Muhammad Aslam Niazi**, Principal, Balochistan Agriculture College, Quetta
12. **Mr. Zaffar Yab Haider**, Director General (Pest Warning), Lahore
13. **Mr. Abid Hussain Qureshi**, Director, Agriculture Extension, Hyderabad
14. **Mr. Asif Majeed**, President Evyol Group of Companies, Faisalabad
15. **Ms. Nighat Jawwad**, CEO Food Tech Solutions, Lahore
16. **Mr. Faisal Shahid**, MD Faisal Group of Industries, Multan

Video Link:

1. **Prof. Dr. Muhammad Aslam Khan**, Dean Faculty of Agriculture, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad
2. **Mr. Khawaja Muhammad Mohsin Masood**, Director, Mahmood Group of Industries, Kabirwala

Proxy:

1. Mr. Muhammad Khan Baloch, Executive Director, Agriculture Research Institute, Mirpur Khas

Apologies:

1. Dr. Muhammad Javed Tareen, Director General, Agriculture Research, Quetta.
2. Dr. Qazi Fayaz ud Din, Director, Model Farms, Agri. Extension, Department KP

NAEAC Secretariat Staff:

1. Mr. Raja Mehtab Yasin, Dy. Director, Admin & Finance
2. Mr. Abdullah, IT Coordinator
3. Mr. Kausar Saeed Awan, Liason Officer
4. Ms. Mehwish Siddique, Registration Coordinator