



MINUTES OF 16TH MEETING OF NATIONAL AGRICULTURE EDUCATION ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

28 DECEMBER 2020

The 16th Meeting of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was held on **December 28, 2020 at 9:30 A.M. in the Mural Hall of Higher Education Commission (HEC), H-9, Islamabad**. Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq A. Rajwana, Chairperson NAEAC, chaired the meeting attended by 16 members (Annexure-I).

2. The meeting commenced with recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chair warmly welcomed all honorable members especially new ones and complimented them for their support and commitment to achieve the council objectives. He paid special tributes for members who participated in person in this meeting observing Covid-19 SOPs. The Chairperson highlighted the salient achievements of the council with future vision to improve its working. He emphasized the major challenges like financial sustainability of the council, augmenting the subject evaluator pool and revision of evaluation manual (Toolkit) incorporation of new subjects as mandated by 14th council meeting and hand holding of emerging HEIs for improving standards of education. He also raised his concern related to mushroom growth of agriculture DAI's in the country without proper infrastructure and formal approval of HEC.

3. After the introductory remarks by the Chair and introduction of all members, item-wise agenda of the meeting presented for consideration and approval. A summary of the decisions taken in the meeting is given below:

Agenda Item#1: Confirmation of Minutes of 15th Council Meeting

4. Minutes of 15th meeting of the Council presented for confirmation of the council members. Prof. Dr. Qamaruddin Chachar proposed the minutes and Prof. Dr. Ahmad-Ur-Rahman Saljoqi and Dr. Tahira Yasmin seconded for approval. In the absence of any comments and objection, *the minutes of the fifteenth Meeting of the Council were approved as presented.*

Agenda Item#2: Overview of NAEAC's Operational Activities

5. The Chairperson presented the achievements of the council during the last financial year including 8 zero visits covering 17 degree programs, 15 on-site accreditation and evaluation visits covering 34 degree programs by the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs), 2 review meetings with the Heads of Agriculture Education Institutions besides 5 quality assurance and accreditation awareness seminars etc. In total 34 degree programs of 10 institutions were evaluated and their rating was shared with honorable council members.

Agenda Item#3: Consideration and Approval of the External Evaluation/Accreditation Ratings of Agriculture Degree Programs Evaluated During FY 2019-20

Decision: The Council members examined the evaluation ratings of 34 degree programs in 10 institutions reviewed by NAEAC during 2019-20 and approved the ratings as recommended.

Agenda Item#4: Review Meetings to follow the Implementation of AIC Recommendations

6. The Chairperson, NAEAC briefed the Council on the purpose and objectives of the Review Meeting and shared that two review meetings covering nine degree programs were conducted during 2019-20. The recommendations of the review meetings were shared with the honorable members.

Decision: Members acknowledged the review meeting process initiated by NAEAC since it involves concerned authorities of the host institutions and the Council to discuss the issue in detail that need improvement.

Agenda Item#5: Proposed Annual Work Plan for FY- 2020-21

7. Chairperson, NAEAC presented annual work plan for FY 2020-21 consisting of four major activities of accreditation process covering external evaluation and assessment of 71 degree programs including zero visits, formal accreditation visits, follow-up visits and 2nd round visits. In addition, three review meetings, eight awareness seminars, four training workshops and two council meetings are also planned for FY 2020-21. In all, the council plans to undertake at least 45 visits of the concerned institutions subject to the COVID 19 situation.

Decision: *The Council members endorsed and approved the work plan activities for FY 2020-21.*

Agenda Item No. 6: Proposed Budget Allocations for FY- 2020-21

8. The Chair presented estimated budget 2020-21 as per operational work plan and budget estimates of Rs. 9,865,850 (Ninety Eight Lac Sixty Five Thousand Eight Hundred and Fifty Rupees Only) sub divided into different heads including establishment cost of Rs. 4.2 Million. Dr Nadia Tahir, Managing Director QAA, HEC suggested to initiate new activities like review/development of curriculum, training of focal persons and evaluators/experts in the newly added programs in consultation with QAA and NAHE. She also emphasized to develop endowment fund for future sustainability of the council.

Decision: *The Council members endorsed the proposed budget allocation for the FY 2020-21*

Agenda Item No.7: Consideration and Approval of Essential Staff Posts in NAEAC on Contract basis

9. The Chairperson presented the detail of essential staff required in the NAEAC Secretariat and also highlighted the observation of internal audit team for not having mentioned/approved sanctioned posts in the bylaws of the council. The Chairperson asked for the ex-post facto approval of seven existing (Secretary/Office Manager ii) Deputy Director Coordination iii) IT Coordinator iv) Assistant Director Admin & Finance v) Assistant Director Coordination vi) Software Engineer/Web Developer vii) Dispatch Rider/Office Attendant) and two new posts (Registration Officer/Account Officer and Dispatch Rider/Office Attendant). Honorable members pointed out that for the betterment of council staff, a unified structure of all five HEC established councils should be in place. However keeping in view the present audit observation, the request of NAEAC may be approved till new system is permitted by HEC.

Decision: *The Council members agreed with the ex-post facto approval of seven posts and creation of two new posts as per actual need of the NAEAC till a unified service structure for all councils is notified by HEC.*

Agenda Item No.8: Consideration and Approval to Receive Advance Payment of Accreditation Fee

10. The Chairperson highlighted the current practice of the council in collecting accreditation fee from HEIs after on-site visits. Some HEIs are not cooperating with the council for smooth payment of accreditation fee even after repeated reminder emails and calls. In contrast other HEC established councils are collecting accreditation fee in advance. It is submitted that NAEAC may be allowed to collect accreditation fee from HEIs prior to the visits with effect from January 2021. This will help to carryout smooth accreditation activities in efficient manners.

Decision: The Council members agreed with the proposal to collect accreditation fee in advance with effect from January 2021.

Agenda Item No.9: Consideration and Approval for Review Meetings Fee

11. The Council has conducted 14 review meetings so far in 14 institutions free of charge. For this, the Council bears all expenses without charging any fee to the institution. It is proposed that an amount of Rs.50,000/- per visit may be charged from the host institutions for arrangement and organization of review meetings.

Decision: The Council members approved Rs. 50,000 per visit for Review Meeting as proposed.

Agenda Item No. 10: Planning for Optimization of Student Intake in Agriculture DAI's of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

12. The Chairperson emphasized the observations raised by participants during the visit to University of Swabi, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa related to several institutions in the radius of 100 km offering undergraduate agriculture education and the difficulties being faced for the intake of students and sustainability of the programs. A detailed presentation keeping in view the Khyber Pakhtunkhwa situation was presented/shared with the honorable members. It was also noticed that this situation is not only related to Khyber Pakhtunkhwa rather it applies to whole country.

Decision: The Council members mandated the NAEAC to hold a series of meeting of the Vice Chancellors initiating from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and come up with some acceptable solutions for the betterment of quality education in agriculture sector.

Agenda Item No. 11: Approval of Honorarium for Academic Audit of NAEAC

13. As per directive of HEC, Prof. Dr. Aman Ullah Malik, Director Institute of Horticultural Sciences, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad was requested by QAA to conduct academic performance audit of NAEAC since its inception. The council is of the opinion that it was time consuming and exhaustive exercise and the expert deserve respectable honorarium.

Decision: After discussion MD, QAA suggested that this exercise has been carried out for all the Councils on behalf of HEC and the honorarium will also be paid by HEC as per rules.

Agenda Item No. 12: Publication of Quarterly E-newsletter

14. The honorable members were presented hard copies of e-newsletter published by council so far. First volume having four issues and 2nd volume having one issue have been released covering all the activities carried during July 2019 to September 2020.

Decision: The council members appreciated the efforts of the NAEAC Secretariat and suggested to continue this activity on regular basis with improved features to make it more professional.

Agenda Item No. 13: Ranking of Agriculture Degree Programs

15. NAEAC is mandated to carryout accreditation of agricultural institutions and their departments, faculties and disciplines by giving them appropriate ratings of agriculture degree programs. As per NAEAC by-laws accreditation is a mandatory process for all relevant academic programs offered by public and private sector institutions. The incentive for obtaining accreditation enhance recognition of such programs in the agriculture community and for prospective students.

16. After thorough discussion keeping in view the merits and demerits of the ranking, the honorable members suggested not to rank the universities, departments rather rating should be publically announced for general community and in particular for students and their parents.

Decision: The honorable members agreed to publish rating of the different degree programs on website as well as on print media.

Agenda Item No. 14: Consideration and Approval for the Initiation of Annual Evaluation (ACR) of NAEAC Employees

17. The Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) of the public sector organizations is to evaluate the performance of employees (Contract/ Adhoc /Regular) annually in form of Annual Confidential Report (ACR) which is maintained to promote, acknowledge or measure the overall suitability of employees for further promotion, award of bonus, honorarium etc. This matter was considered in the 14th council meeting under agenda item no.18. As per decision, a committee comprising of i) Dr. Amjad Hussain, Director R&D, HEC ii) Ms. Humaira Quddus, Dy. Director QAA, HEC and iii) Dr. Abdul Ghaffar, Secretary NAEAC was constituted to review the proposed ACR form. The committee recommended to opt the HEC ACR forms for the council employees with some modifications.

Decision: The honorable members approved the suggested ACR form and maintenance of ACR of each NAEAC employee.

Agenda Item No. 15: Rationalization of Accreditation Duration

18. NAEAC is accrediting and rating the degree programs as per its byelaws and SOPs for undergraduate programs in DAI's as W (80-100%), X (65-79%), Y (50-64%) and Z (40-49%). Currently council is accrediting the programs for four years irrespective of rankings. However, keeping in view the closeness of X₃ to Y₁ and X₁ to W₃, it is proposed that next round duration of accreditation of X₃, X₂ and X₁ & W category programs may have the duration as 2, 3 and 4 years, respectively.

Decision: The honorable members agreed with the proposal.

Agenda Item No. 16: Request from Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Science, PMAS AAUR regarding the limits of credit hours of B.Sc. (Hons) Agriculture Degree Programs

19. Prof. Dr. Fayyaz Ul Hassan, Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Science, PMAS Arid Agriculture University, Rawalpindi submitted his concerns related to total credit hours required for graduation in agriculture. The Chairperson emphasized the issue regarding maximum and minimum credit hours of B.Sc. (Hons) Agriculture Degree Programs. At present some 136-140 credit hours are being offered while prior to this scheme credit hours range was 170-190.

Reduction of credit hours parallel to business subjects left a gap of basic and diversified information on subject. The honorable members had a detailed discussions on the issue and majority members were of the opinion that deciding the limit of credit hours for a degree program is not under the purview of NAEAC. However, NAEAC may write a letter with comments to the convener of undergraduate policy and if issue is not settled then may be forwarded to HEC for consideration at appropriate forum.

Decision: *The honorable members agreed with the discussion and decided that NAEAC may write a letter with comments to the convener of undergraduate policy and if issue is not settled then may be forwarded to HEC for consideration at appropriate forum.*

Agenda Item No. 17: Request from Dean, Faculty of Crop Production, SAU, Tandojam regarding Nomenclature of Biotechnology Degree Program in Agriculture DAI's

20. Prof. Dr. Qamaruddin Chachar, Dean Faculty of Crop Production, SAU, Tandojam has requested that some of the Agriculture DAI's are offering B.Sc. and M.Sc. degree program in Agricultural Biotechnology and some are offering as Biotechnology. It is requested that the nomenclature of degree should be same i.e. Agricultural Biotechnology at least in all Agriculture DAI's. Honorable members discussed the matter at large and suggested the council to write letter to relevant DAI's with suggestion to write Agriculture Biotechnology on the degrees where applicable.

Decision: *The honorable members advised the council to write letter to relevant DAI's with suggestion to write Agriculture Biotechnology on the degrees where applicable.*

Agenda Item No. 18: Request from Dean, Faculty of Agriculture Sciences, University of Haripur regarding the nomenclature of Bachelors and Masters Programs in Agriculture

21. Prof. Dr. Abid Farid, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture Sciences, the University of Haripur has requested Chairperson NAEAC raising issue of variable nomenclature of Bachelors and Masters Programs in Agriculture DAI's. It was mentioned that Bachelor and Master Degree programs in agriculture was named B.Sc. (Hons) and M.Sc. (Hons) as 16-year and 18-year programs. As a matter of fact, nomenclature of BS and MS are global standards for 16-year and

18-year programs respectively. The Chairperson, NAEAC clarified that HEC has already equated the B.Sc. (Hons) to BS and M.Sc. (Hons) to MS. Hence the issue stands already resolved.

Decision: *The honorable members agreed with the discussion and suggested to follow the HEC decision in this regard to avoid problem in future for degree attestation.*

Agenda Item No. 19: Approval for Mobile Charges to NAEAC Employees

22. The Chairperson, NAEAC emphasized the frequent contacts required for the arrangements and follow up for various activities of the visits in off time. Hence, following Mobile Charges are recommended:

S. No	BPS	Amount (Rs)
i)	20 and above	2,000/ Month
ii)	18-19	1,000/ Month
iii)	16-17	500/ Month

23. After detailed discussions it was conditionally approved that if the precedence exists in any other council then may be implemented otherwise not recommended. However, Chairperson can add this allowance in the salary.

Decision: *The Honorable members decided that if the precedent exists in any other council then may be implemented.*

Agenda Item No. 20: Inauguration of Registration of Agriculture Graduates/Professional/Fellows

24. As per decision of the 14th meeting of council, NAEAC has prepared Agriculture Personal Registration System (APRS) for registration of agriculture graduates/ professional/fellows. The VCs of University of Agriculture Faisalabad, Lasbela University of Agriculture, Water & Marine Sciences, Uthal, Sindh Agriculture University, Tandojam, MNS University, Multan and University of Agriculture, D.I. Khan were asked to join the online inauguration of APRS ceremony. The NAEAC Secretariat had prepared the system for individual student's registration following the auto system guidelines. However, during the discussion the Central Registration System involving the HEIs was recommended. Furthermore the fee of Rs. 500 was

recommended to charge during final year (7th semester) instead at the time of admission at university level. The fee so collected by HEIs along with complete data for registration of students will be submitted to NAEAC.

Decision: After thorough online discussion at VCs/representatives level, it was decided to involve the Universities for getting the students data and fee collection from students. The information format will be given to university authorities who will provide all required information along with the fee of final year graduating students. NAEAC will prepare the Registration Card after receiving the student's registration information and fee. The prepared Card will be provided to the respective HEIs. The students will get the card along with the degree from their parent institutions.

List of Participants of 16th Council Meeting held on December 28, 2020

1. **Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq Ahmad Rajwana**, Chairperson NAEAC/Pro-VC, MNSUA, Multan
2. **Dr. Nadia Tahir**, Managing Director, QAA, HEC, Islamabad
3. **Dr. Tahira Yasmin**, PSO/registrar, PIASA, NARC, Islamabad
4. **Prof. Dr. Javed Akhtar**, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture, Uni. Of Agriculture, F
5. **Prof. Dr. Ahmad-Ur-Rahman Saljoqi**, Dean, Faculty of Crop Protection Sciences, UAP
6. **Prof. Dr. Qamaruddin Chachar**, Dean, Faculty of Crop Production, SAU, Tandojam
7. **Prof. Dr. Shafqat Saeed**, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture & Env. Sciences, MNSUA, Multan
8. **Dr. Muhammad Rashid**, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture, LUAWMS, Uthal
9. **Prof Dr. Ejaz Ahmad Khan**, Project Director, The University Agriculture, D. I. Khan
10. **Prof. Muhammad Aslam Niazi**, Principal, Balochistan Agriculture College, Quetta
11. **Dr. Muhammad Zafar Iqbal**, Director General, Ayub Agriculture Research Institute, Faisalabad
12. **Mr. Noor Muhammad Baloch**, Director General, Agriculture Research Sindh, Tandojam
13. **Mr. Khawaja Muhammad Mohsin Masood**, Director, Mahmood Group of Industries, Kabirwala
14. **Dr. Muhammad Tariq Masood**, Joint Scientific Adviser (IL), Min. of Science & Technology

Proxy:

15. **Dr. Jummah Khan Tareen**, Director General, Agriculture Research, Baluchistan
16. **Dr. Abdul Rauf Khan**, Director General, Agriculture Research, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa

Apologies:

1. **Prof. Dr. Fayyaz ul Hassan Sahi**, Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Science, AAU, Rawalpindi
2. **Mr. Asif Majeed**, President, Evyol Group of Companies, Multan
3. **Ms. Nighat Jawwad**, C.E.O, Food Tech Solutions YUMZ (PK), Lahore
4. **Mr. Faisal Shahid**, Managing Director, Faisal Group of Industries, Multan

NAEAC Secretariat Staff:

1. Dr. Abdul Ghaffar, Secretary
2. Mr. Abdullah, IT Coordinator
3. Mr. Kausar Saeed Awan, Deputy Director, Coordination
4. Mr. Malik Arshad, Assistant Director, Admin & Finance
5. Mr. Muhammad Faraz Afzal, Assistant Director Coordination
6. Mr. Zafar Ali, Software Engineer/Web Developer
7. Mr. Muhammad Shafqat, Dispatch Rider