



MINUTES OF 17TH MEETING OF NATIONAL AGRICULTURE EDUCATION ACCREDITATION COUNCIL

AUGUST 23, 2021

The 17th Meeting of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was held on **August 23, 2021 at 9:30 am in the Lecture Hall of Higher Education Commission (HEC), H-9, Islamabad**. Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq A. Rajwana, Chairperson NAEAC, chaired the meeting attended by 21 members (Annexure-I).

2. The meeting commenced with recitation from the Holy Quran. Chairperson appreciated the honorable members for sparing precious time and warmly welcomed all new members especially newly appointed Vice Chairperson, Prof. Dr. Fauzia Yusuf Hafeez. He paid special tributes for members who participated in person in this meeting observing Covid-19 SOPs. Later chair appreciated the efforts and services rendered by Ex-Vice Chairperson (Late) Prof. Dr. Nadeem Akhtar Abbassi for the growth and progress of NAEAC and offered Fatiha. Chairperson informed new members of the Council that NAEAC is operational since 2008. In opening remarks chair briefed the members about mission and objectives of the Council. The main objectives include quality assurance of agriculture degree programs to make by implementing HEC developed accreditation policies, processes and guidelines. Twenty four disciplines are under the purview of NAEAC. NAEAC evaluation criteria consists of four major and three minor components. Each Major criteria is subdivided into several standards. He further added that in the year 2020-21 NAEAC initiated APRS (Agriculture Personal Registration System), which include three categories viz a viz Agriculture graduates, Agriculture Professionals and Fellows (non-degree agriculture experts). As far as APRS was concerned, the software was tested with the help of PMAS-AAUR. Later on software was shared with 45 HEIs, Thirty HEIs have created account. Fourteen HEIs have shared the data while data of other 16 HEIs is under process. NAEAC is trying to take all concerned HEIs onboard in near future. Total number of students registered till August 28, 2021 is 973. Chairperson admitted that progress regarding APRS is bit slow but we are steadily progressing and making it sure to complete it in best possible manners. He apprised members that previously a commercial financial audit was a standard practice but from this year HEC has also started financial as well as academic audit of the council. He appreciated this step of HEC as it will help Council to improve its working. The Chairperson briefed the members about different challenges faced by Council which include financial sustainability of NAEAC, lack of service structure within council, irrational increase in number of admissions by HEIs, non-involvement of council in degree verification by HEC and no distinction between degrees from accredited and non- accredited institutions. He emphasized that recognition of councils by federal and provincial public service commissions, is inevitable and he has already started to hold meetings with Chairmen of provincial public service commissions.

3. After the introductory remarks by the Chair and introduction of all members, Secretary, NAEAC presented item-wise agenda of the meeting for consideration and approval. A summary of the decisions taken in the meeting is given below:

Agenda Item#1: Confirmation of Minutes of 16th Council Meeting

4. Minutes of 16th meeting of the Council presented for confirmation of the council members.

Decision: In the absence of any note by honorable members the minutes of the sixteenth Council Meeting were unanimously approved as presented.

Agenda Item#2: Implementation Status of Last Council Meeting and Action Taken

5. Secretary NAEAC presented implementation status of last council meeting and status of action taken for the information of council members.

Decision: The council members broadly expressed their satisfaction on implementation however were concerned about the pending items.

Agenda Item#3: Overview of NAEAC's Activities

6. Chairperson, NAEAC presented the activities of the council during the last financial year including 25 on-site accreditation and evaluation visits covering 53 degree programs by the Accreditation Inspection Committees (AICs), pre-accreditation/zero visit of 7 degree programs and 4 review meetings with the Heads of Agriculture Education Institutions besides 6 quality assurance and accreditation awareness seminars etc. The members agreed and appreciated the efforts of NAEAC Secretariat to achieve the goal of the council.

Agenda Item#4: Consideration and Approval of the External Evaluation/Accreditation Ratings of Agriculture Degree Programs Evaluated During FY 2020-21

7. Secretary NAEAC presented the summary of external evaluation of 50 degree programs including nine degree programs in X₁ category, ten in X₂, seventeen in X₃, ten in Y₁, three in Y₂ and one in Y₃ categories.

Decision: The Council members examined the evaluation ratings of 50 degree programs in 18 institutions reviewed by NAEAC during 2020-21 and unanimously approved the ratings as recommended.



Agenda Item#5: Proposed Annual Work Plan for FY- 2021-22

8. Secretary NAEAC presented annual work plan for FY 2021-22 consisting of three major activities of accreditation process covering external evaluation and assessment of 91 degree programs including accreditation visits (74) and pre-accreditation/zero visits (17) besides 31 awareness seminars. In addition, four training workshops for departmental focal persons, one training workshop for program evaluators and one council meeting are also planned for FY 2021-22.

Decision: The Council members unanimously endorsed and approved the work plan activities for FY 2021-22.

Agenda Item No. 6: Proposed Budget Allocations for FY- 2021-22

9. Secretary presented estimated budget of Rs.13.387 million for FY 2021-22 as per operational work plan including establishment cost of Rs.6.202 million. It was decided to develop an endowment fund for future sustainability of the council and for that HEC finance department may be taken on board.

Decision: The Council members endorsed the proposed budget allocation for the FY 2021-22 and decided to hold a council meeting on financial management shortly. It was also decided that necessary consultation may be carried out by HEC finance directorate.

Agenda Item No. 7: Consideration and Approval for Revision of Accreditation Fee Structure

10. Chair briefed the members about the variation in fee charged by five HEC established Accreditation Councils (Rs.175,000/- to Rs.250,000/- per degree program). Current accreditation fee structure of the National Agriculture Education Accreditation Council (NAEAC) was approved nearly two years ago. It is needed that the Council should revise its accreditation fee as per increased inflation to meet sustainable levels particularly in the absence of HEC support. A summary of existing and proposed fee is given below:

Activity	Existing Accreditation Fee Structure, 2019-20			Proposed Revised Accreditation Fee Structure, 2021-22		
	Public Institutions	Private Institutions	Public-Private Partnership Institutions	Public Institutions	Private Institutions	Public-Private Partnership Institutions
Accreditation Fee per visit	Rs.80,000/- per discipline	Rs.250,000/- per discipline	Rs.200,000/- per discipline	Rs.100,000/- per discipline	Rs.300,000/- per discipline	Rs.250,000/- per discipline
Accreditation Awareness Seminar Fee	Rs.50,000/- per seminar	Rs.50,000/- per seminar	Rs.50,000/- per seminar	Rs.100,000/- per seminar	Rs.100,000/- per seminar	Rs.100,000/- per seminar
Review Meeting Fee	Rs.50,000/- per meeting	Rs.50,000/- per meeting	Rs.50,000/- per meeting	Rs.100,000/- per meeting	Rs.100,000/- per meeting	Rs.100,000/- per meeting

Decision: *The house agreed with the necessity to increase fee structure based on actual costs incurred and inflation factors and unanimously approved the proposal to revise fee structure as presented.*

Agenda Item No. 8: Consideration and Approval for Revision of Appeal Fee

11. Secretary briefed the Council about the right of appeal. Current appeal fee of NAEAC was approved in 7th council meeting in 2012 and after that no revision has been made. It is therefore, pertinent that the Council should revise appeal fee as suggested below:

Existing Appeals Fee, 2012-13	Proposed Appeals Fee, 2021-22		
	Public Institutions	Private Institutions	Public-Private Partnership Institutions
Rs.30,000/ per program	Rs.100,000/- per program	Rs.300,000/- per program	Rs.250,000/- per program

Decision: *The Council Members agreed for the enhancement of appeal fee and approved the proposed fee structure.*

Agenda Item No. 9: Revision of Evaluation Manual (Toolkit) including new Emerging Disciplines

12. Secretary presented the summary of revision in Evaluation Manual (Toolkit). The Secretary also emphasized that in addition to revision of sub-standards in each major criteria of evaluation, self-assessment report material was also incorporated in this toolkit to avoid the duplication work and wastage of resources.

Decision: *The honorable members agreed with the revision however Chairperson requested the members to go through this revised manual toolkit within next twenty days and give us their valuable feedback to incorporate in the revised manual. The soft copy was emailed to all honorable members and Secretariat looking forward for their valuable comments for the improvement of toolkit.*

Agenda Item No. 10: Accreditation of Post-Graduate Degree Programs

13. Secretary briefed the Council that initially both undergraduate and post-graduate degree programs were accredited by NAEAC. Later, for the last one year, accreditation of Master degree programs was stopped as per instruction of QAA, HEC Islamabad. However, during 16th council meeting, Dr. Nadia Tahir, then MD, QAA suggested to reinstate accreditation of Master degree programs.

Decision: *Director/In-Charge, QAA, HEC iterated that NAEAC should write a letter to QAA who will take this matter to HEC Commission Meeting for final decision.*

Agenda Item No. 11: Current Establishment Status of NAEAC and Creation of New Posts

14. Secretary presented the currently available human resources with the council and emphasized the need to create two new posts with title “Deputy Director Programs” and “Deputy Director Admin & Finance”.

S#	Post	No of Posts	BPS	Status	Salary Package
1	Secretary/Office Manager	1	19	Available	Rs.85,000/-
2	Deputy Director Coordination	1	18	Available	Rs.65,000/-
3	IT Coordinator	1	17	Available	Rs.72,853/-
4	Assistant Director Admin & Finance	1	17	Available	Rs.50,000/-
5	Assistant Director Coordination	1	17	Available	Rs.45,000/-
6	Software Engineer/Web Developer	1	16	Available	Rs.40,000/-
7	Dispatch Rider/Office Attendant	2	05	One Available	Rs.25,000/-
8	Deputy Director Programs	1	18	New	
9	Deputy Director Admin & Finance	1	18	New	

Decision: *The honorable members after having thorough discussion and deliberations agreed to create two new posts as suggested.*

Agenda Item No. 12: Consideration and Approval for Grant of Disparity Reduction Allowance to IT Coordinator

15. The Secretary briefed the honorable members regarding the decision taken in 11th council meeting held on October 26, 2015, where NAEAC employees opted the Basic Pay Scale and Allowances based on BPS (2015) with effect from July 01, 2015 and also referred the Govt. of Pakistan vide Notification No. F.No.14 (1) R-3/2021-90 where 25% of Basic Pay Disparity Reduction Allowance to all federal Govt. employees with effect from March 01, 2021 was approved. Only one employee of council (IT Coordinator) fall in that category.

Decision: *After thorough discussion honorable members approved disparity reduction allowance (25% Basic Pay) in favor of IT Coordinator with effect from March 01, 2021 as per rules.*

Agenda Item No. 13: Consideration/Approval of Raise in the Salary of NAEAC Staff as per Government Decision

16. Reference regulation wing of Finance Division of Government of Pakistan Office Memorandum F.No.1 (1) Imp/2021-216 dated July 8, 2021 regarding the Grant of Adhoc Relief Allowance-2021 @10% to the Civil Employees of the Federal Government.

Decision: *Honorable members unanimously approved the 10% Adhoc Relief Allowance on basic pay to NAEAC employees with effect from July 01, 2021.*

Agenda Item No. 14: Paperless Accreditation System at NAEAC

17. NAEAC is considering environment friendly accreditation process to be adopted to save the resources as well as the environment. This paperless system is also cost effective. For this purpose, NAEAC Software Engineer will either is modify Accreditation Automation System (AAS) developed by NCEAC or develop own. Hopefully, this process will be completed during this year and NAEAC will then shift to AAS for efficient and environment friendly process of accreditation.

Decision: *The honorable members appreciated the idea and stress to shift on paperless accreditation system as soon as possible. In this regard Software Engineer/Web Developer given this task to complete Accreditation Automation System till December 2021.*

Agenda Item No. 15: Inauguration of NAEAC Transfigured Website

18. NAEAC had a static website since its inception. Recently NAEAC has developed a transfigured website where the routine activities, photographs and other accomplishments could be uploaded on desired interval basis very easily. During the current era the role of social media and Information & Communication Technology (ICT) is very critical and necessitated to make aware related and general masses.

Decision: *On behalf of honorable members, Chairperson inaugurated this new Transfigured Website. The members appreciated the efforts of NAEAC, Secretariat.*

Agenda Item No. 16: Consideration and Approval to add Additional Emerging Disciplines Pertaining to Agriculture in Purview of NAEAC

19. NAEAC believe in dynamism and moving forward with the emerging agricultural disciplines. Till date 24 disciplines of agriculture comes under the scope of Council. However, there are some additional emerging disciplines which also fall under the scope of the Council as given below:

- i. Dairy Sciences/Dairy Technology
- ii. Nutritional Sciences/Nutrition and Dietetics
- iii. Range Management
- iv. Any other suggested by the council members

Decision: *The honorable council members approved the inclusion of three new disciplines as proposed with immediate effect.*

Current Work Agenda Item No.1: Consideration and Approval of the External Evaluation/Accreditation Ratings of Agriculture Degree Programs

Decision: *The Council members examined the evaluation ratings of 3 degree programs reviewed by NAEAC during 2020-21 and unanimously approved the ratings as recommended.*

Current Work Agenda Item No.2: Rationalization of Program Evaluators Remuneration/Honorarium

- A) The Secretary briefed the honorable members regarding the decision taken in 14th council meeting held on September 30, 2019, where the NAEAC has enhanced remuneration/ honorarium of Program Evaluators from Rs.5,000/- to Rs.7,000/- per day. Due to austerity measures it was proposed that evaluation fee of Rs.7,000/- may be paid on per visit/program instead of per day as 2nd day would be compensated in TA/DA and
- B) To avoid the delay in AIC report submission, following time linked honorarium was suggested as below:
- If AIC report submitted within 2 weeks of evaluation date Rs.7,000/- per visit/program
If AIC report submitted after 2 weeks but within 4 weeks of evaluation date Rs.5,000/- per visit/program
If AIC report submitted after 4 weeks of evaluation date Rs.3,500/- per visit/program

Decision: *The council members after thorough discussion agreed and approved the proposal with modification of remunerations as Rs.10,000/- per visit/program with following conditions.*

(A) If AIC report submitted within 2 weeks of evaluation date Rs.10,000/- per visit/program; (B) If AIC report submitted after 2 weeks but within 4 weeks of evaluation date Rs.7,500/- per visit/program; (C) If AIC report submitted after 4 weeks of evaluation date Rs.5,000/- per visit/program with immediate effect. For the purpose of convenience first Monday of the following week after visit will be the initial day for starting calculations and all AIC members will be intimated through email.

Current Work Agenda Item No.3: Waive-off Accreditation fee for the Food Science & Technology (FST) degree program at Dadabhoy

20. Secretary briefed the council members that Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education Karachi, a private institute, was offering FST degree program since 2018-19. On the request of the institute an accreditation visit was carried out on November 13, 2019. They paid half fee Rs.125,000 via cheque no.10121341 dated 06-05-2020. The left over half fee was pending. The same has been pointed out by the auditors. Council members are requested to waive-off the remaining fee Rs.125,000 so that the audit observation may be set-aside.

Agenda item is withdrawn as remaining fee is received from Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education (DIHE), Karachi.

Current Work Agenda Item No.4: Request from Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Science, PMAS AAUR regarding Injustice/ Indiscrimination by PPSC

21. Prof. Dr. Fayyaz ul Hassan, Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Science, PMAS Arid Agriculture University, Rawalpindi has requested Chairperson NAEAC raising issue regarding change of syllabus of agriculture officers/farm managers from subject specific to general ability. The agriculture is technical subject but Punjab Public Service Commission (PPSC) is considering it as a general subject while completely ignoring the technical aspects of it. Whereas for other technical subjects related posts syllabus distribution is 80% subject related and 20% general ability test.

22. The agriculture graduates having potential in subject specific degree to have both theoretical and practical knowledge/experience and will have to deal with technical aspects while in service. It will not be justice to assess them just on the general knowledge bases. In previously prescribed syllabus 80% subject specific and 20% general knowledge but current syllabus it is totally unacceptable to conduct examination for the agriculture posts.

23. It is therefore requested that the order of 100% MCQS out of subject may kindly be withdraw so that students with satisfaction continue their professional degrees and reconsider recently announced syllabus of agriculture back to 80% agriculture and 20% general ability test and approach concerned authorities for rectification.

Decision: The honorable members advised the NAEAC Secretariat to take up this matter on priority basis with concerned authorities (PPSC).

Current Work Agenda Item No.5: Request from Director General, Agriculture Research Sindh regarding Increasing Degree Credit Hours in NCRC

24. Mr. Noor Muhammad Baloch, Director General, Agriculture Research Sindh, Tandojam sent a proposal through its proxy Mr. Nabi Bux, Director Technical II that decision of lowering credit hours as per non-technical degree programs has ruined the quality of graduates produced, hence he suggested that NAEAC should play its role to review this policy.

Decision: Honorable members mandated the NAEAC to take up this case with concerned authorities in HEC, Islamabad.

List of Participants of 17th Council Meeting held on August 23, 2021

1. **Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq Ahmad Rajwana**, Chairperson NAEAC
2. **Prof. Dr. Fauzia Yusuf Hafeez**, Vice Chairperson NAEAC
3. **Mr. Nasir Shah**, Director/In-Charge, QAA, HEC, Islamabad
4. **Dr. Syed Zaheer Hussain**, Joint Scientific Adviser, Ministry of Science and Technology, Islamabad
5. **Prof. Dr. Javed Akhtar**, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad
6. **Prof. Dr. Ahmad-Ur-Rahman Saljoqi**, Dean, Faculty of Crop Protection Sciences, UAP
7. **Prof. Dr. Fayyaz ul Hassan**, Dean, Faculty of Crop and Food Science, PMAS AAU, Rawalpindi
8. **Prof. Dr. Qamaruddin Chachar**, Dean, Faculty of Crop Production, SAU, Tandojam
9. **Prof. Dr. Shafqat Saeed**, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture & Environmental Sciences, MNSUA, Multan
10. **Dr. Tamoor Khan**, Dean, Faculty of Agriculture, LUAWMS, Uthal
11. **Prof. Muhammad Aslam Niazi**, Principal, Balochistan Agriculture College, Quetta
12. **Dr. Muhammad Zafar Iqbal**, Director General, Ayub Agriculture Research Institute, Faisalabad
13. **Dr. Juma Khan Tareen**, Director General, Agriculture Research Institute, Baluchistan
14. **Dr. Abdul Rauf Khan**, Director General, Agriculture Research Institute Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Peshawar
15. **Dr. Muhammad Anjum Ali**, Director General Agriculture (Extension & AR), Agriculture Department, Punjab
16. **Mr. Malik Nasir**, Director Planning, Agriculture Extension, Agriculture Livestock Fisheries & Cooperative Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
17. **Mr. Asif Majeed**, President, Evyol Group of Companies, Multan
18. **Ms. Nighat Jawwad**, C.E.O, Food Tech Solutions YUMZ (PK), Lahore
19. **Mr. Faisal Shahid**, Managing Director, Faisal Group of Industries, Multan
20. **Mr. Khawaja Muhammad Mohsin Masood**, Director, Mahmood Group of Industries, Kabirwala

Proxy:

1. **Mr. Noor Muhammad Baloch**, Director General, Agriculture Research Sindh, Tandojam

Apologies:

1. **Dr. Tahira Yasmin**, PSO/registrar, PIASA, NARC, Islamabad
2. **Mr. Allah Warayo Rind**, Additional Director General, Planning of Monitoring Cell, Agriculture Supply and Prices Department, Sindh

NAEAC Secretariat Staff:

1. **Dr. Abdul Ghaffar**, Secretary
2. **Mr. Abdullah**, IT Coordinator
3. **Mr. Kausar Saeed Awan**, Deputy Director, Coordination
4. **Mr. Malik Arshad**, Assistant Director, Admin & Finance
5. **Mr. Muhammad Faraz Afzal**, Assistant Director Coordination
6. **Mr. Zafar Ali**, Software Engineer/Web Developer
7. **Mr. Muhammad Shafqat**, Dispatch Rider